

**Minutes of Meeting held at Thistle House, Edinburgh
Monday 20 March 2023
Present**

The Hon Lord Matthews, Deputy Chair
Dr Sue Walker, Commissioner
Professor Ailsa Henderson, Commissioner

Isabel Drummond-Murray, Secretary
Colin Wilson
Pat Allan
Douglas Campbell
Yvonne Croll
Alistair Grant

Apologies

Mr Dominic Cuthbert, Ordnance Survey, Assessor
Ms Janet Egdell, National Records for Scotland, Interim Chief Executive

Minutes of previous meeting

1. The minutes of the 14 February 2023 meeting were agreed with no amendments.

Matters Arising

2. The Secretary introduced Pat Allan, a new member of the Secretariat. The Commission welcomed Mr Allan to his first Commission meeting.
3. The Commission heard that Ms Janet Egdell has replaced Mr Paul Lowe as Interim Chief Executive at National Records for Scotland.
4. The Secretary informed the Commission that she had received a report from the Office of Secretary of State for Scotland (OSSS) following an audit of the sponsorship of the Commission that took place on 26 January 2023.
5. The Commission noted that Boundaries Scotland (BS) is developing its constituency provisional proposals for the Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries and it plans to consult on them in Spring 2023.

Business Update

6. The Commission heard that the Secretariat plan to draft the 2023 Review Final Report in a similar format and style to its 2018 Review Final Report. The Secretary agreed to share a copy of the previous report to enable the Commission to offer any comments or suggestions in advance of the drafting of the 2023 Review Final Report.

2023 Review: Final Proposals – Glasgow, Inverclyde, Renfrewshire Council areas (Paper 2023/10)

7. The Commission considered Paper 2023/10 which provided further analysis of the initial and revised boundaries in the east of Glasgow and responses to those consultation stages that focussed on that area. This was with a view to

establishing which particular aspects of the Initial and Revised Proposals were popular with respondents in the east of Glasgow.

8. The Commission agreed that there was a similar number of responses received during the Initial and Revised consultation stages. The Commission was content that the changes made following the initial proposals which resulted in two north-south constituencies in the east of Glasgow were preferable given the responses to both consultation stages.
9. The Commission agreed to adopt without amendment the Revised Proposals (as in Appendix A) in the east of Glasgow as the Commission's Final Recommendations subject to consideration of all other constituencies.

2023 Review: Final Proposals – Argyll and Bute, Aberdeenshire, Highland and Moray Council areas (Paper 2023/11)

10. Dr Walker declared an interest in this paper as she lives within this council area grouping.
11. At its meeting on 14 February 2023 the Commission considered Paper 2023/05 and asked the Secretariat to consider alternative boundaries that respected local ties by: Culloden, so it could sit within an Inverness constituency; Elgin, to consider a new housing developments; and by Strichen to maintain local ties in Aberdeenshire.
12. The Commission discussed the alternative suggestion and agreed that it responded to comments made during the public consultation in a positive way and felt it offered an improved boundary and would improve local ties in those three areas.
13. The Commission noted that the option in the paper which accommodated these changes at Culloden, Elgin and Strichen required the boundary in Wester Ross to revert to the proposed Highland North constituency boundary from the initial proposals. The Commission reflected on how the proposed Highland North constituency had been unpopular during initial consultation due to its large area. The Commission considered an alternative boundary in Wester Ross by Torridon and Loch Maree which reduced the area of the proposed Caithness, Sutherland and Easter Ross constituency.
14. The Commission also asked the Secretariat to refine the boundary in Central Buchan between the proposed Aberdeenshire Central and Aberdeenshire North and Moray East constituencies to enable the boundary by Fetterangus to follow the A950, the main road in the area. The Secretariat emailed the Commission a revised boundary by Fetterangus after the meeting. The Commission agreed to this boundary in correspondence.
15. The Commission agreed to adopt with amendments the alternative option (as in Appendix A), with amendments by Culloden, Elgin, Strichen/ Fetterangus and

Wester Ross as the Commission's Final Recommendations subject to consideration of all other constituencies.

2023 Review: Final Proposals – Angus, Clackmannanshire, Dundee City, Falkirk, Fife, Perth and Kinross, Stirling and West Lothian Council areas (Paper 2023/12)

16. At its meeting on 14 February 2023 the Commission considered Paper 2023/07 and asked the Secretariat to consider revised boundaries: in West Fife by Kingseat which could either follow a community council area boundary or an historical constituency boundary; with a Stirling and Strathallan constituency; and to consider if the shape of the proposed Clackmannanshire and Forth Valley constituency could be improved by adding Denny to a Falkirk constituency and Grangemouth to a Clackmannanshire and Forth Valley constituency.
17. The Commission noted that historically constituencies in this area had crossed the M90 motorway. The Commission agreed to follow the Kingseat community council area boundary rather than a historical constituency boundary in the area which stretched as far as the northern boundary of Fife council area because it may better reflect local ties in the area.
18. The Commission agreed to add Auchterarder and Aberuthven to a Stirling constituency but asked the Secretariat to refine the boundary by Auchterarder in a way that used more distinct geographical boundary features. The Commission agreed to the revised boundaries by Auchterarder in correspondence after the meeting.
19. The Commission agreed on the alternative design in Appendix C which included Grangemouth rather than Denny in the proposed Clackmannanshire and Forth Valley constituency because it may better reflect local ties in the area.
20. The Commission agreed to adopt the alternative options with amendments as the Commission's Final Recommendations subject to consideration of all other constituencies.

2023 Review: Final Proposals – Dumfries and Galloway, East Dunbartonshire, North Lanarkshire, South Lanarkshire, Scottish Borders and West Dunbartonshire Council areas (Paper 2023/13)

21. At its February meeting the Commission considered Paper 2023/08 and asked the Secretariat to bring a revised paper to the next Commission meeting that considered the existing constituency boundary to the east of Motherwell.
22. The Commission discussed the alternative option in Appendix A and agreed it maintain local ties by Newmains and to avoid Carfin being split between constituencies.
23. The Commission agreed to adopt without amendment the alternative option (as in Appendix A), as the Commission's Final Recommendations subject to consideration of all other constituencies.

2023 Review: Final Proposals – Constituency names and designations (Paper 2023/14)

24. The Commission discussed Paper 2023/14 and finalised constituency names for its 2023 Review Final Recommendations. The Commission agreed to the designation of constituencies by correspondence after the meeting and that all burgh constituencies covered an area of 108 km² or less and all county constituencies 108 km² or more.

Aberdeen City Council area

25. Having received no other suggestions or objections to the constituency names in the Revised Proposals, the Commission agreed to adopt the names Aberdeen North and Aberdeen South for the constituency names in this council area grouping.

Angus, Clackmannanshire, Dundee City, Falkirk, Fife, Perth and Kinross, Stirling and West Lothian council areas

26. The Commission discussed the many suggestions it had received for alternative constituency names in this council area grouping.

27. The Commission agreed to adopt: Alloa and Grangemouth; Angus and Perthshire Glens; Arbroath and Broughty Ferry; Bathgate and Linlithgow; Cowdenbeath and Kirkcaldy (as the boundary had changed from the existing Kirkcaldy and Cowdenbeath constituency); Dundee Central; Dunfermline and Dollar; Falkirk; Glenrothes and Mid Fife (to differentiate it from the Scottish Parliament constituency name); Livingston; North East Fife; Perth and Kinross–shire; and Stirling and Strathallan for the constituency names in its Final Recommendations.

Argyll and Bute, Aberdeenshire, Highland and Moray council areas

28. The proposed West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine constituency was unchanged from the existing arrangements and the Initial/ Revised Proposals.

29. The Commission discussed the suggestions it had received for alternative constituency names in this council area grouping. The Commission noted that some respondents to the consultation suggested a desire to reference historical county names.

30. The Commission agreed to adopt: Aberdeenshire North and Moray East; Argyll, Bute and South Lochaber; Caithness, Sutherland and Easter Ross; Gordon and Buchan; Inverness, Skye and West Ross–shire; Moray West, Nairn and Strathspey; and West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine for the constituency names in its Final Recommendations.

City of Edinburgh, East Lothian and Midlothian council areas

31. The Commission's Revised Proposals had retained the existing constituency names in the City of Edinburgh and Midlothian council areas. The proposed Edinburgh West and Midlothian constituency boundaries were unchanged from the existing arrangements and the Initial/ Revised Proposals.

32. The Commission discussed the many suggestions it had received for alternative constituency names in this council area grouping. The Commission noted that some respondents to the consultation suggested constituencies should avoid compass points in the Edinburgh constituency names.
33. The Commission noted that in: Edinburgh the Revised Proposals broadly followed the existing boundaries and agreed to retain the existing Edinburgh constituency names, except Edinburgh East as it should include reference to Musselburgh; and East Lothian there was strong opposition to the proposed East Lothian and Lammermuirs constituency name and the use of hill names in constituency names more generally.
34. The Commission agreed to adopt: Edinburgh East and Musselburgh; Edinburgh North and Leith; Edinburgh South; Edinburgh South West; Edinburgh West; and Midlothian for the constituency names in its Final Recommendations. The Commission also agreed Lothian East as the boundary no longer followed the East Lothian Council area boundary.

Dumfries and Galloway, East Dunbartonshire, North Lanarkshire, Scottish Borders, South Lanarkshire and West Dunbartonshire council areas

35. The Commission's Revised Proposals had retained the existing constituency names in Dumfries and Galloway, Scottish Borders and West Dunbartonshire council areas.
36. The Commission discussed the suggestions it had received for alternative constituency names in this council area grouping as well as the population of the main towns within area.
37. The Commission agreed to adopt: Airdrie and Shotts; Berwickshire, Roxburgh and Selkirk; Coatbridge and Bellshill; Cumbernauld and Kirkintilloch; Dumfries and Galloway; Dumfriesshire, Clydesdale and Tweeddale; East Kilbride and Strathaven; Hamilton and Clyde Valley; Mid Dunbartonshire; Motherwell, Wishaw and Carluke; Rutherglen; and West Dunbartonshire for the constituency names in its Final Recommendations.

East Ayrshire, North Ayrshire and South Ayrshire council areas

38. The Commission's Revised Proposals had retained the existing East Renfrewshire constituency boundaries and names.
39. There was a suggestion to re-name the proposed Ayr, Carrick and Cumnock constituency as Ayr and South Ayrshire.
40. Due to the fact the proposed Ayr, Carrick and Cumnock constituency includes part of East Ayrshire as well as part of South Ayrshire the Commission agreed to retain the existing names.

41. The Commission agreed to retain the existing constituency names as its Final Recommendations in this area: Ayr, Carrick and Cumnock; Central Ayrshire; Kilmarnock and Loudoun; and North Ayrshire and Arran.

East Renfrewshire council area

42. The Commission's Revised Proposals had retained the existing East Renfrewshire constituency boundary and name.
43. Having received no objections to or suggestions for this constituency name in the Revised Proposals, the Commission agreed to retain the existing East Renfrewshire constituency name as its Final Recommendations.

Glasgow City, Inverclyde and Renfrewshire council areas

44. The Commission discussed the suggestions it had received for alternative constituency names in this council area grouping. The Commission noted that one respondent had suggested constituency names should consider localities in Glasgow rather than compass points.
45. None of the existing constituency boundaries were retained within this grouping.
46. The Commission noted that a response stated Glaswegians consider the River Clyde when explaining what is north or south of Glasgow and suggestion to rename the proposed Glasgow South East constituency as Glasgow East.
47. The Commission agreed to retain the revised constituency names: Inverclyde and Renfrewshire West; Glasgow North; Glasgow North East; Glasgow South; Glasgow South West; Glasgow West; Paisley and Renfrewshire North; and Paisley and Renfrewshire South as the constituency names in its Final Recommendations. The Commission also agreed to rename Glasgow South East as Glasgow East because it is situated north of the River Clyde.

Finance Update (Paper 2023/15)

48. The Commission noted the finance update.

Any other business

49. The Secretariat was asked to canvass for a meeting date in mid-April 2023.

Secretariat
March 2023